

REVIEW COMMENT SHEET

TYPE OF REVIEW (Check one):		NCHRP Guide <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		TECH REPORT <input type="checkbox"/>	
KEY NO:	n/a	PROJECT:	NCHRP 15-33 FY 2006	DESCRIPTION:	AASHTO Guide for Transportation Landscape and Environmental Design Chapter 1 and 2
REVIEWER:	Greg Vitely		TCED Rep:	Idaho	DATE OF REVIEW: 6/6/2008
COMMENT NUMBER	COMMENT LOCATION	COMMENT			ACTION
1	Cover	Consider changing top line to AASHTO Guide for Transportation Environmental Design			
2	Cover	“Sensibilities” is a little difficult for me and isn’t this a guide for a variety of users? Consider: Designing Transportation Projects into the Environment			
3	Xii, last paragraph	What is a “complete road”. Is it coined phrase from this guide or is it something I should know?			
4	Xiii, last paragraph	“....NEPA by furthering the integration of environmental design into highway planning....			
5	Page 3, Fig 1	Looks like the end is missing.			
6	Page 3, 3 rd para	I keep wanting to put a heading on the paragraph of Context Analysis			
7					
8					
9					
10					
11					
12					

Project:
Key #

Date:
Page 1 of 5

REVIEW COMMENT SHEET

13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			

Project:
Key #

Date:
Page 2 of 5

REVIEW COMMENT SHEET

28			
29			
30			
31			
32			
33			
34			
35			
36			
37			
38			
39			
40			
41			
42			

Project:
Key #

Date:
Page 3 of 5

REVIEW COMMENT SHEET

43			
44			
45			
46			
47			
48			
49			
50			
51			
52			
53			
54			
55			
56			
57			

Project:
Key #

Date:
Page 4 of 5

REVIEW COMMENT SHEET

58			
59			
60			
61			
62			
63			

Project:
Key #

Date:
Page 5 of 5

REVIEW COMMENT SHEET

TYPE OF REVIEW (Check one):		NCHRP Guide <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	TECH REPORT <input type="checkbox"/>	
KEY NO:	n/a	PROJECT:	NCHRP 15-33 FY 2006	DESCRIPTION: AASHTO Guide for Transportation Landscape and Environmental Design Chapter 3
REVIEWER:	Greg Vitley		TCED Rep:	Idaho
DATE OF REVIEW:		6/6/2008		

COMMENT NUMBER	COMMENT LOCATION	COMMENT	ACTION
1	Page 17, 3 rd paragraph 3 rd sentence	How about: Sensibility in environmental design can add....	
2	Page 17, 4 th paragraph 2 nd sentence	Is this phrase or program being coined? How about: Having good data on what works and why it works facilitates the design of an effective corridor.	
3	Page 21, 3.2 General	This seems like a good area to mention the importance of working with and getting buy in from land use authorities.	
4	Conclusion, after the dash	This may imply that professional convictions are difficult to keep if the expectations of the stakeholders are matched. We want to say that matching stakeholder's convictions improves upon professional convictions. At the dash you could add, 'with full community support' add remove the rest.	
5			
6			
7			
8			
9			
10			
11			
12			

Project:
Key #

Date:
Page 1 of 5

REVIEW COMMENT SHEET

13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			

Project:
Key #

Date:
Page 2 of 5

REVIEW COMMENT SHEET

28			
29			
30			
31			
32			
33			
34			
35			
36			
37			
38			
39			
40			
41			
42			

Project:
Key #

Date:
Page 3 of 5

REVIEW COMMENT SHEET

43			
44			
45			
46			
47			
48			
49			
50			
51			
52			
53			
54			
55			
56			
57			

Project:
Key #

Date:
Page 4 of 5

REVIEW COMMENT SHEET

58			
59			
60			
61			
62			
63			

Project:
Key #

Date:
Page 5 of 5

REVIEW COMMENT SHEET

TYPE OF REVIEW (Check one):		NCHRP Guide <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		TECH REPORT <input type="checkbox"/>	
KEY NO:	n/a	PROJECT:	NCHRP 15-33 FY 2006	DESCRIPTION:	AASHTO Guide for Transportation Landscape and Environmental Design Chapter 4
REVIEWER:	Greg Vitley		TCED Rep:	Idaho	DATE OF REVIEW: 6/6/2008

COMMENT NUMBER	COMMENT LOCATION	COMMENT	ACTION
1	Page 27, caption on pic	Perhaps reflect the first sentence of the first paragraph a little better. Ie: Geometrics are a major determinant of how well a road fits into the landscape.	
2	Page 28, 2 nd para, 5 th line	Consider using, 'environmental sensibility'	
3	Page 29, 1 st para, 2 nd line	Delete 'can' after designer.	
4	Page 31, Pavement, general	Consider a bit more on pavement design and how it affects noise? Quiet pavement's design life, climatic challenges, materials, textures and porosity etc. Noise reduction can be achieved in some cases by minor changes in pavement design with little additional cost. A good contact is Mark Swanlund (202-336-1323) who is contracted with FHWA regarding tire pavement noise and pavement design.	
5	Page 39, Bridges	Impacts of a bridge foot print can be very important to minimizing or improving impacts to wildlife and fish habitat. Ie: Longer bridges to allow for wildlife to pass underneath and minimizes piers in water. May decrease road wildlife road mortality and improves wildlife connectivity. Also consider something on designs which maintain historic integrity of a bridge rehabilitation.	
6	Page 42, Retaining Walls, General	Consider discussion on wildlife issues associated with this element such as trapping them on the road sometimes causing them to jump the rail to their death.	
7	Page 43, Retaining Walls, general	Although it applies it was a little strange to see noise walls under the retaining wall section.	
8	Page 45, Medians	In arid states it may be best to not plant much at all...	
9	Page 53, Public Art, bullets	Perhaps add one: Help communities develop a 'sense of place'.	

Project:
Key #

Date:
Page 1 of 5

REVIEW COMMENT SHEET

10	Page 59, 4 th para	1 st sent: After erosion add –and sediment 2 nd sent: the SWPP should be referred to per EPA Construction General Permit as Storm Water Pollution Prevention Plan(SWPPP). After all, if we could prevent storm water we wouldn't need to worry about the pollution in it. Additionally, mention importance of designing for erosion and sediment control is best started early in design rather than as an after thought. The plan should be integral to the design.	
11	Page 60, graphic	Great example pic for sustainability.	
12	Page 61, Vegetation, 5 th para, 1 st sent	I guess global warming is now being considered factual by the government. Is the evidence irrefutable? –had to say it.	
13	General	Much better use of examples in this version!	
14	Page 64, 4 th para, general	Is the calc correct? In 20 seconds at 55 mph I think I would go see much more than 30 feet. Nearly a half mile.	
15	Page 65, general	Costs associated with incorrect plant selection can be exorbitant.	
16	Page 68, 5 th para	Great statement.	
17	Page 74, Noise Abatement, 3 rd para, 1 st line	Consider that with a berm neither the receiver nor the source can be close to the barrier, therefore, even though they may be a little better the cost associated with ROW and the benefit not realized because of the difference may cause it to be a wash. I recommend removing the 1 st sentence. Also, berms can provide opportunities for DOT to work with adjacent owners to provide property needed.	
18	Page 75, 3 rd bullet	I think it should be from the barrier to the receiver rather than the edge of pavement.	
19	Page 75, vegetative buffers	This is not cost effective in most cases, especially in arid climates because the cost of needed ROW. Then, at 100 feet you will see a drop in noise levels just from the distance the receiver is away from the source. If you are talking about a preservation situation I understand.	
20	Page 77, General	Wildlife crossing are a major movement in the U.S. Consider more discussion on this. Ie: rules of thumb for design, direction on how and when to consider them and placement, what makes them ineffective? Or, reference to a guidance document.	
21	Page 84, last para, 1 st sent	Consider quotes around “view of the road”.	

REVIEW COMMENT SHEET

22	Page 94	Consider mention of the importance of DOT's and land use authorities to work together to ease the trouble of changing access control. Planning a secondary system is difficult if access control is changed on an existing highway. Local land use authorities can be huge assets to developing a system that minimizes congestion and traffic conflicts with local cities. Ie: locals using state systems for their local commutes rather than being able to stay off the state system to move with in their own towns. This may not be an issue in all parts of the county.	
23			
24			
25			
26			
27			
28			
29			
30			
31			
32			
33			
34			
35			

Project:
Key #

Date:
Page 3 of 5

REVIEW COMMENT SHEET

36			
37			
38			
39			
40			
41			
42			
43			
44			
45			
46			
47			
48			
49			
50			

Project:
Key #

Date:
Page 4 of 5

REVIEW COMMENT SHEET

51			
52			
53			
54			
55			
56			
57			
58			
59			
60			
61			
62			
63			

Project:
Key #

Date:
Page 5 of 5

REVIEW COMMENT SHEET

--	--	--	--

Project:
Key #

Date:
Page 6 of 5



